Community, commodification, cosmopolitanism: *Salsa* and ideologies of language in transnational settings

Britta Schneider
*Goethe Universität Frankfurt am Main, Macquarie University Sydney*

2008
COMMUNITY, COMMODIFICATION, COSMOPOLITANISM:
SALSA AND IDEOLOGIES OF LANGUAGE
IN TRANSNATIONAL SETTINGS

Britta Schneider
Goethe Universität Frankfurt am Main
Macquarie University Sydney
schneider@em.uni-frankfurt.de
October 2008

Salsa, a global urban music and dance phenomenon, is an interesting example for the emergence of transnational cultural spheres. Salsa has its roots in the Americas but is enormously successful worldwide. While the language spoken on the dance floors is usually that of the respective (national) environments, the Spanish language is seen as being the authentic means of expression for the music so that outside Latin America, Salsa always brings along the Spanish language. However, attitudes to multilingualism can differ not only from country to country or from city to city but rather from Salsa-network to Salsa-network.

This paper describes the Salsa-scene of Sydney Australia, and links this to different stances towards multilingualism. Affiliation with different local scenes and styles of Salsa dance – L.A. style, Colombian style, Cuban style – are mediated by stances on multilingualism, and in its account of this, the paper scrutinizes the manner and extent to which language ideologies in a transnational setting challenge established power structures and reified discursive concepts of language.

It has become a commonplace that local social worlds are becoming more diverse and multiple with the accumulating material and non-material flows of produced by what is called "globalization". Although there is a general acknowledgement of the multicultural and multilingual nature of contemporary societies, popular and academic discourses are often unable to overcome traditional frameworks of categorizing the world. Thus, many studies on multilingualism in urban environments examine e.g. language identities or the vitality of the language of an ethnic group within a majority society, where the existence of separate ethnic groups is seen more or less as given fact (see e.g. Extra and Verhoeven 1999, Fürstenau 2003, Gibbons and Ramirez 2004). In effect, although studies within this approach can be highly empowering, they mirror a nationalist "container" perspective (Pries 2001), where the world is seen as consisting of separate cultural groups that have come into contact only because of the intricate processes of globalization.

The study presented here, instead of examining language ideologies (Woolard 1998) and identities within communities that are imagined as national or ethnic entities, documents a research project that was carried out in a transnational setting1 where people from various cultural but also linguistic backgrounds intermingle and engage in a cultural practice that in itself has transnational origins. The paper introduces three different Communities of Practice

---

1 Transnationalism is not understood as the simple act of crossing national borders but as an approach that questions epistemological frameworks that see the nation, its culture, its territory and its borders as given point of departure for social research (see Clifford 1994, Glick Schiller, Basch and Szanton Blanc 1997, Hannerz 1996b, Pennycook 2007, Wimmer and Glick Schiller 2002).
(Holmes and Meyerhoff 1999, Wenger 1998) in Sydney, Australia, that engage in, or are constituted through, Salsa dancing. The Communities of Practice (CofP) approach is instructive in a transnational context as it enables us to categorize individuals not according to essentialist traits but according to "mutual engagement in some common endeavor" (Eckert and McConnell-Ginet 1998:490), where national background does not necessarily play a role. The respective discourses on the role of language in general and of Spanish in particular within each of the CofPs are discussed as indexical of broader ideologies of global capitalist culture, ethnicity and cosmopolitanism. One of the questions to be answered is whether the forms of cultural appropriation and the language ideologies that are found within this transnational culture weaken nationalist, "container" epistemologies about the nature of language and society. It is important to understand that the existence of different cultural and linguistic groups, also of national groups, is here understood not as the result of separation and difference but as the consequence of active social differentiation (Pratt 1987:59). The fact that humans form separate groups is not seen as a result of essential differences but as being based in the enactment of difference due to the fact that the very groups are in contact with each other. Notions of cultural groups and their boundaries, but also of "languages" as given systems are thus seen as the result of socio-historical discourses. Within these, an understanding of the role of power is crucial and it will be discussed whether the discourses on language as found in the different CofPs question monocultural, monolingual ideologies and nationalist hierarchies of power in society.

1. SALSA – A TRANSNATIONAL, TRANSMODAL PHENOMENON

Salsa, a dance and music style, is a transnational, transmodal and also global phenomenon. While there are discussions concerning its territorial origin, scholars usually agree that "even in its 'birthplaces,' Salsa has always been deterrioralised: the history of Salsa involves such intricate transnational connections that it is difficult to pinpoint its 'original' location" (Pietrobruno 2006:20). Thus Salsa has been a "trans" phenomenon from the start (see footnote 1), and the cultural roots of its rhythms and melodies cross not only the Caribbean region and many parts of the Americas but are furthermore transatlantic as a lot of its features relate to heritages of slavery and stem from African traditions. Further, there are elements of Jazz music that have had an influence on Salsa (for a concise history of Salsa see Pietrobruno 2006:chapter 1). The emergence of Salsa in the 1970s was tied to political motivations, where people of Latin American descent in New York, fighting for the just treatment of Latinos, tried to develop a pan-Latin consciousness in cultural roots in order to express identity and pride (ibid: 50). The multiplicity of origins and influences, as well as its political history, contrasts with many mainstream conceptions of Salsa in Europe and also in Australia. Here, Salsa is often taken to be of purely "Latin" descent, with its hybrid nature becoming invisible; it is mainly commercialized versions of the music, also called Salsa Romántica, that are listened to, while older songs with political contents are mostly unknown and newer versions, which integrate hip hop rhythms and other contemporary musical elements, are refused as unauthentic.

Today, Salsa has become a truly global phenomenon. It is particularly the dance that has gained popularity worldwide and has entered the music scene and nightlife in many parts of the world. Dance is central in the constitution of local Salsa communities and it brings along the music, whose lyrics are virtually always in Spanish. Despite the difficulty of defining its origin, the language and also the rhythms of Salsa connect to a transnational "Latin" identity (Aparicio and Jández 2003, Pietrobruno 2006:17). However, the values and meanings attached to Salsa dancing, the Spanish language, the styles of dancing and the reproduced elements of Latin culture obviously differ in the particular re-locations of the cultural phenomenon in different parts of the world (see Robertson 1998). Traditionally, in Latin America, Salsa is popular mainly in the Caribbean region and Colombia. As a popular leisure time activity, Salsa dancing has rather "low-class origins" (Pietrobruno 2006:3) but middle
classes within the countries of origin as well as in other countries of Latin America have adopted the dance after it had become fashionable in the middle classes of Europe and North America. Salsa dancers, schools, parties, conventions, clubs, meetings, etc. can now be found in many parts of the world, as e.g. in the USA, in Europe, in Japan, in some African countries, such as Congo (Hosokawa 1997), and also in Australia. In geographical contexts outside Latin America, many migrants of Latin American descent adopt a pan-Latin identity only after having arrived in the "host" country (see e.g. Papadopulos 2003); the term "Latin", referring to anyone coming from countries south of the United States, is a U.S. invention (Pietrobruno 2006:108). It has to be kept in mind that the term "Latin" in the US American understanding, which has also been adopted in some Australian contexts, is different from what it denotes in Latin America itself, where the term is either not used or relates to working class US Americans with a Latin American background. The concept of a pan-Latin identity has also been influenced by the interest in creating "Latin" (rather than smaller, national) markets by musical but also other industries (ibid.:86).

This paper introduces a study of Salsa Communities of Practice in Sydney, Australia’s largest and highly multicultural city, and it shows that the re-location of Salsa culture is not only different in the respective countries but also differs significantly on very local levels, far below the scale of the city itself. The Salsa CofPs of Sydney relate to different types of Salsa dance, which differ technically in terms of dance moves, as well as in their histories and developments. The dance styles and CofPs are embedded in particular histories and have thus become indexical of ideological trajectories, carrying different relations to language, class, ethnicity and globalization. These relations provide insight into post-national linguistic identities and the development of language ideologies in transnational culture. In order to study such developments, Communities of Practice are useful units of analysis as the circular reproduction of essentialist categories such as citizenship, country of origin or mother tongue can be avoided, while contemporary theories of cultural practice and of linguistic identity can be taken into account (Barton and Tusting 2005, Holmes and Meyerhoff 1999, Rampton 2000b).

The languages used in Salsa contexts differ according to the national environments and it can be assumed that wherever Salsa occurs, Spanish comes along, at least in the lyrics of the songs. Similarly, we can also assume that the respective dominant language of the national context will be present where people learn, listen or dance to Salsa. But more than that, empirical observation in Germany and Australia has shown that in Salsa CofPs, at least in these national environments, a lot of people are not only interested in dance and music but also in the culture and language of its origin (Papadopoulos 2003, Schneider in press). In particular contexts of Salsa, there are many enthusiastic learners of Spanish who identify with the language up to a point, but whose enthusiasm for language learning stems neither from their ethnic heritage nor from instrumental considerations (e.g. job opportunities). In particular, it is individuals who perform linguistic identities that cross traditional "native" linguistic identities that make these Salsa CofPs a highly interesting example of cultural and linguistic development in transnational cultural contexts. In addition, there are also native Spanish speakers who are visible, active and also central members in some of the multiethnic CofPs, which makes the study of the Salsa phenomenon also vital in studying linguistic and cultural contact zones (Pratt 1987:60, Rampton 2000b).

On a larger theoretical level, the observation and analysis of Salsa as an example of transnational culture and linguistic contact zones may be beneficial for understanding new patterns of non-ethnic linguistic identification but also for new conceptions of language in post-national social contexts, in which the commodification of languages and of linguistic identities plays an increased role (Heller 2003). Salsa also involves transmodal symbolic behavior – meanings are conveyed not only via verbal means but also through other types of symbolic behavior (Jaworski and Coupland 2006:6) – and in the Sydney case, this also shows that ideologies of language, identity and multilingualism can be related to particular types of body movements. In sum, the "expression of cultural heritage for a given individual" is not neces-
necessarily the "result of his or her geographic location or national identity but [is rather a consequence of] how the dance is acquired and maintained" (Pietrobruno 2006:2). So "identity" is understood not as an essential trait of a person's descent but rather as being related to various forms of cultural symbolism and practice.

Before turning to the social meanings of different dance styles in Sydney in more detail, a short discussion of identities as non-essential and constructed, as embedded in ideologies and discourses, is in order.

2. DISCOURSE, IDEOLOGY AND IDENTITY
Investigating language ideology and identity constructions within the context of Salsa, a discursive, performative theoretical approach is very productive. In contemporary poststructural theory, identities and ideologies and indeed social reality itself, are understood as developed in interaction and as the historical result of societal discourse (see e.g. Berger and Luckmann 1987, Blackledge and Pavlenko 2001, Butler 1990, Butler 2003, De Fina et al. 2006, Djité 2006, Gay et al. 2000, Hall 2000, Joseph 2004, Le Page and Tabouret-Keller 1985, Pavlenko and Blackledge 2004). Taking identity, understood as concepts for categorizing individuals into groups, as an example for the general perspective of discursive approaches to social reality, it can be shown that identities are not "given" or simply inherited. Although there are certain types of identity that are difficult to neglect in our everyday practice, e.g. gender or ethnic identity, poststructural approaches to identity emphasize that no identificational category is simply existent or "natural". It is through the constant performance of an identity, of its associated ways of dressing, moving or speaking – through its "doing" – that it is reproduced and maintained (Butler 1990). The very idea and existence of specific identities is constituted within social, historically developed discourses that shape behavior and thought in relation to societal power struggles and ideologies (Foucault 1973, Foucault 1978 (2000)).

To give an example, in the majority population of Australia, the identity of a Salsera, a female person that practices Salsa dancing, has been developed during the 1990s within a discourse that actively aimed at bringing Salsa to a mainstream public. This identity position can be taken up relatively voluntarily – which differentiates this type of identity from other types, e.g. gender or ethnicity, which are usually seen as more fixed. Before Salsa and its accompanying discourses became mainstream in Australia, it would have been impossible for an individual to "become" a Salsera, as the concept was basically unknown. It is only in the context of a certain discourse that an identity can be recognized and can, accordingly, be performed. However, the identity position of Salsera already existed by then in the Americas (see above), which is why the concept, although adopted by many Australians, is still tied to its Caribbean and trans-American origins. It can thus be assumed that traditional notions of ethnicity are in a way subverted by the "usage" of this identity by people who do not "originally" belong to one of the ethnic groups that are considered to be Latin. This subversion may be understood as an instance of the loosening of constraints that national epistemes have imposed on individuals who are otherwise categorized according to their cultural heritage, irrespective of their own personal desires and irrespective of the fact that the existence of cultural groups themselves is related to class and power struggles. We will see, however, that the type of subversion found in Salsa contexts does not necessarily put into question hegemonic concepts of dominance and power.

It is not only concepts of identity that can be regarded as discursively constructed. Language ideologies, the study of "shared bodies of commonsense notions about the nature of language in the world" (Rumsey 1990:346), is, from a discursive perspective, more or less synonymous with "discourses on language" (similar approaches, even if not always spelled

---

2 Ideology is here not understood in a Marxist sense, where a place "outside" ideology would be assumed; for a discussion on the term in its "critical" and its Foucauldian understandings, see Mills 1997.
out explicitly, can be found in Blommaert 1999, Errington 2001, Gal and Irvine 1995, Heath 1989, Heller 2007, Heath and Gal 2000, Joseph and Taylor 1990, Kroskrity 2000, Schieffelin et al. 1998, Woolard 1998). Within this framework of language ideology, the whole concept of "language" as given entity can be questioned and understood as discursively constructed itself (see also Makoni and Pennycook 2007). The term "language", in its understanding as a differentiable, bounded object, as "Spanish", "German" or "English", is also seen as the result of historical discourses that have constructed the object "language" in line with interests of power. The term "multilingualism" should be understood accordingly: a contingent discursive construct embedded in a certain social and historical environment. We will get to know different types of this construction later on.

3. SALSA IN SYDNEY

The actual study of the discourses that construct language, identity and multilingualism in a particular way, as it is presented here, is based on an ethnographic approach which is not so much interested in the language use of Salseras and Salseros but more in the formation of the different CofPs and the different discourses on language and identity that exist within them. Interviews with the members of the scene – dance teachers, regular participants of Salsa events, organizers of Salsa events – provide the main source of information. In total, 16 interviews have been conducted, six in the first CofP (3.1.), three in the second CofP (3.2.) and seven in the third one (3.3.). Applying ethnographic methods, the interview questions were adopted to the content of the particular interview so that the interviews had the rather informal, conversational character of expert talk (Flick 2004, Witzel 1996). These interviews have been accompanied by participant observation (attendance of dance classes, Salsa events in clubs and at festivals, membership in relevant newsgroups), observation of internet resources and several unrecorded, more informal conversations. The analysis is informed by ethnography, with a focus on content analysis. As implicit discourses influence the being and acting of informants, elements from several approaches of discourse analysis (see e.g. Cameron 2001) are taken as analytical tools to complement the ethnographic approach.

Salsa dancing in Sydney is very popular. Approaching Salsa in Sydney as an outsider, the number of posters and flyers that are found in the inner city area, or the Central Business District (CBD), of Sydney is impressive. Furthermore, there is a large number of internet resources that give access to dates and locations of Salsa events, newsgroups (see e.g. sydneysalsa.com, but there are many more) and also "meet-up groups" where people arrange meetings and parties via the internet (see www.salsa.meetup.com/199/). As in other national environments (for Canada see Pietrobruno 2006, for Germany see Schneider in press), the identity formation of Salsero or Salsera in Sydney, as found on images on posters, flyers and websites, but also in Salsa venues, expresses a strong heteronormativity (Wagenknecht 2007), where female and male identities are strictly separated and sexualized. The expression of these sexualized and traditional gender identities is certainly part of the success story of Salsa, while the reasons for that have to be discussed elsewhere (see Schneider in press). Salsa identities also convey a certain lifestyle, connected to images of happiness, sensuality and emotionality – stereotypical images of "Latin" life, as they are produced by commercial agents from music and tourist markets. The language of the products and communication materials of the Salsa CofPs in Sydney is usually English but there are often single words or expressions in Spanish (e.g. fiesta [party], picante [spicy], noche [night]). As has already been mentioned above, the role of the Spanish language differs in the different CofPs. Multilingual and monolingual identities can be related to different Salsa-scenes and, as this study brought

---

3 An early study that was able to show the discursive nature of "language" in this "differential sense" (Bauman 1999, Risager 2006) has been carried out by Le Page and Tabouret-Keller in the 1970s (Le Page and Tabouret-Keller 1985) and it is characteristic that this took place in a (post-) colonial, multiethnic environment where puristic national categories had come into trouble at an early stage.
to the fore, it is possible to differentiate three communities of Salsa practice in Sydney with different language ideologies.

3.1. MAINSTREAM SALSA
First of all, there is a Salsa CoP that I call the "mainstream" community. It is the biggest and most visible CoP of the three types. Posters regarding the major events are found everywhere in the centre of town; it is easy to find dance schools of this type on the internet, parties are major events which take place in elaborate and expensive venues in the Central Business District of Sydney. As a result, this community is most likely to be the first one that an outsider gets into contact with – as it happened in this research project. Compared to a preliminary study that had been realized in Frankfurt am Main, Germany, where native and non-native speakers of Spanish intermingle within the Salsa scene, it was interesting to observe that in Sydney's "mainstream" Salsa CoP, people neither learn Spanish, nor do native speakers of Spanish participate. This absence of people with Hispanic heritage or with an interest in Hispanic language and culture is also connected to the absence of images that express "Latiness" on posters and websites that relate to this CoP. For example on its website (www.clubsalsa.com.au), the main dance school, Club Salsa, refrains from images such as palm trees, palm leaves, sunsets, people with "exotic" hairstyles, darker skin tans or flags from Latin American nations – images that are typically associated with "Latin" culture in e.g. many German contexts. Instead, an abstract symbol that represents fire and a couple that dances, embedded in a landscape of colors that change according to the season, connect only in a very general sense to the cultural background of Salsa. Rather, the visual style of Club Salsa strongly reminds one of other popular mainstream music productions – in terms of the clothing of women and the coloring, it is especially contemporary R'n'B productions that share similar looks (e.g. Destiny's Child, Rihanna and the like).

The style of Salsa that is danced in this CoP is called L.A. Style. This style has been developed in the transnational "Latin" context of Los Angeles, U.S.A. (Pietrobruno 2006:66). It is influenced by Puerto Rican Salsa, swing and ballroom dances and has showy moves and cabaret gestures (ibid.). The influence of ballroom dance is very obvious and is characteristic of this style, which at the same time makes it more accessible to a Western public. While other Salsa styles are characterized by far more body contact, couples who dance L.A. Style usually do not touch each other, only their arms and hands get into contact. Because of the influence of ballroom dance, the steps and turns of L.A. Style are relatively elaborate, complicated and technical. There are competitions, even on a global level, so that the style has a strong performance aspect, whereas other styles are usually not performed in front of an audience. This also makes L.A. style less an expression of popular culture and brings it closer to European "high culture" and elite traditions of dance (ibid.:3).

The majority of members in this context are white and Asian Australians. Their looks and attitudes can be considered mainstream, and most interviewees and other informants work in some kind of office – in banks, insurance companies or advertising agencies. The general public here can be described as white-collar educated middle class. L.A. Style Salsa parties are characterized by expensive, stylish looks, especially in the clothing of participants. At first, the absence of Hispanic people as well as any signs that relate to the cultural history of Salsa seems surprising, as it is also the authenticity of the cultural performance of Salsa that makes it attractive, at least as observed in a German context. But the expression of "Latin" authenticity does not seem to be very important in this context. This is also confirmed by the interviews. When asked about the role of Spanish-speakers and why they are so remarkably

---

4 Principles of "authenticity" are mainly connected to the idea of being "true to one's roots" and to refrain from commercialisation (see Pennycook 2007:chapter 6).
absent in this CofP, an informant, himself a Salsa teacher of Arabian descent, utters the significant sentence:

You don't need to be Italian to make a good Pizza.

Obviously, there are items, traits and actions other than cultural authenticity that are important in gaining status in this context. Considering the strength of ethnicity or nationality in marking borders in many other environments (Barth 1969), this attitude is surprisingly inclusive. It is not assumed that cultural "genuineness" leads to acceptance within the scene but rather the ability to dance. Yet, the remarkable absence of Latin Americans nevertheless shows that national or ethnic identity does play a role, although in a more indirect way. One informant of Chinese heritage who learned to dance himself from Latin Americans and who is now engaged in leading one of Sydney's biggest dance schools, explains that the reason why people of Latin American descent do not participate in this community is their lack of technicality and professionalism:

1. Before that, all the things (0.5)
2. they were passionate, and they were very very strong about their culture and everything (0.5)
3. but they were not very (1) technical.
4. And when we went and asked them, they said, "ah, follow your heart, follow the music"
5. and we got so frustrated.
6. We said "so how do you do the steps?"
7. and they couldn't really break it down (1)
8. they're not very technical

The informant criticizes Latin American Salsa dancers, who obviously assume that dancing is learned by imitation – which is how it is done in Colombia, where the dancers in this case originated from. In Colombia – or rather in the cities in Colombia where Salsa is danced – there is no formal instruction and the dance is acquired at a very young age, in family or community settings (Pietrobruno 2006:3). The informant admits that "they" (which means, in the context of this interview "the Latin people") consider their culture to be important but fail in transmitting their knowledge to others in an understandable way. It is especially the lack of a systematic analysis of the dance steps that the informant criticizes, as in this way, outsiders are unable to learn the dance. The rising tone at the end of line 3, making the passage sound like a question, is a typical Australian intonation in narrative talk that seems to emphasize the utterance in seeking agreement with the interviewer. This, together with the long pause before the word "technical", can be interpreted as the expression of a critical stance towards Latin American Salsa dancers who simply engage in dancing but cannot explain verbally how they actually do it. This is again mentioned at the end of the passage, where the informant concludes that "they" are not technical, this time using the present tense, making the essentialist claim even stronger.

The fact that dancing Salsa within a local community in Colombia is embedded in a different cultural context, with different cultural values (which maybe needs a longer time to understand as it involves more than just the techniques of dance steps) seems to go unnoticed.

---

5 As has been mentioned above, "essentialist" categories such as nationality or cultural background are understood as being culturally constructed, which does not mean, of course, that they are unimportant – they are therefore mentioned if considered to be relevant.
6 See p.24 for transcription conventions.
7 The same line of argument is also found on the website of the dance school (http://www.clubsalsa.com.au/visitors/salsa_scene.html).
here, as it is only the dance that the informant is interested in. Consequently, he and his "business partner" – a friend whom he met when learning Salsa – not only systematically analyzed the dance steps, they also broke down whole movements into smaller sections, as he says, "stripping down things in a very detailed way", before they developed a method of teaching these steps, implementing several "levels" according to which their dance classes are structured. The informant explains that

1. because I am a doctor by training and my business partner engineer,
2. so we are very analytical,
3. so we analyzed all the steps and that's how we (made it?)
4. so we are very methodical, systematic and that's the main reason we, our (thing?) was a big hit

The analytical abilities of the informant and his business partner are seen as the cause for their success in "making Salsa big in Sydney". There are interesting intertextual references here. The approach taken towards Salsa dancing is obviously a projection from types of knowledge acquired in other contexts, mainly business and university. The way they structure and teach Salsa is explicitly taken from these contexts and the informant even calls his school a "business" with a "business plan", "a corporate thing". Accordingly, the website of the school also has a "Mission Statement" (www.clubsalsa.com.au/contact/mission.html), something that is obviously quoted from the world of business and commerce. When asked about what he believes to be the reasons for Salsa being such a success on a global level, the informant maintains that it is because it is something that is easy to make money with. His ability to make money with Salsa is something that the informant is very proud of; he sees no reason to conceal his commercial approach to the cultural practice of Salsa dancing.

In the context of L.A. Style Salsa, the absence of Latin Americans is, however, not only explicable by their failure to engage in commercializing their cultural practices, but also with the fact that Sydneysiders with Latin American background often dance a different style of Salsa and reside far away from the city centre. A dance teacher of European descent refers to Colombian Style – a variety of Salsa mainly practiced in Colombia but also by people in the "ethnic communities" of Sydney – as "backyard Salsa". Furthermore, she maintains that this style, being simpler in terms of technique (see below), is not "real Salsa" but something that "hasn't developed since the 1970s". The fact that there is a large population of Australians of Latin American descent in Fairfield, a working-class suburb of Sydney that is a two hours' bus ride away from the Central Business District, is considered by an L.A. Style DJ to be an additional explanation for their absence in the "bling-bling" venues of the mainstream CoP8.

It is interesting that the Spanish language is also largely absent in mainstream Salsa, as are people of Hispanic descent. There are some instances where Spanish language "tokens" are used on flyers for parties (especially the term fiesta) and the terms for other dances are kept in Spanish (Merengue, Bachata, both dances which are also popular with Salsa dancers). But other than that, no usage of Spanish can be documented. Even the instructions of the dance moves, if they existed before they were adapted to the needs of the commercialized variety of the dance, have been translated into English so that, according to one dance instructor:

everybody can understand them

Even though the majority of informants here are bilingual themselves, and have native languages such as German, Hungarian, Mandarin, Arabic, etc., it is self-evident for them that everybody speaks English and only English. There is no single instance in the interviews in which an informant would mention their bilingual language skills or their cultural back-

---

8 Australia's Multicultural Policy of the 1970s and 1980s and issues of language, identity and space would be interesting topics of discussion but are not covered here.
ground as other from the "normal" anglo-dominated Australian one. When asked about the role of Spanish, informants do not seem to understand the question; they do not see a point in speaking or learning Spanish, as nobody does so in their social environment. The only reason that is mentioned, why knowledge of Spanish might be useful is that one could understand the lyrics of the songs. But then, it is assumed by another dance instructor, they all only deal with love anyways, it's pretty boring.

What can be detected in the discourses of the interviews and from the observations is the appropriation of a cultural practice for a globalized market. Salsa, in a version that has been created in the U.S. context, is seen as commodity to be sold to an audience that has the means to afford an evening in an expensive inner-city venue. Salsa is constructed as a technique that can be analyzed, taught and learned in a systematic fashion. This approach to culture is tied to discourses of capitalism, where culture itself, from material to non-material traits to cultural practices, is considered in its capacity to be sold and consumed. The discourses seem to enforce ethnic discrimination in which the non-commercializing forms of Salsa as practiced by Latin Americans is seen as failure and backwardness.

The hegemony of English in this context is illuminating. The language seems to be connected to ideologies of commercialism and capitalist success. Although not spelled out explicitly, language is here only seen in its "usefulness", as a tool or instrument that conveys information. The ability of language to convey other levels of meaning, especially its ability to perform functions related to identity, become invisible, just like the many native languages of Australia and the fact that most of the members of this CoP are actually (at least) bilingual themselves. English seems to be the unmarked norm that functions in a discursive environment that promotes pragmatism and economic success while the relation of English to identity positions within this discourse is so normalized that it goes unnoticed. Spanish, although omnipresent, seems to function more like a brand, rather than as expression of culture or identity. Words and expressions like "fiesta" or "una noche de Salsa" convey "the Latin touch" – which reminds me of the well-known marketing strategies of multinational companies such as "Bacardi" for the "Bacardi Feeling". The whole CoP may be interpreted as belonging to a global capitalist discourse in which questions of ethnic identity are relatively unimportant and subordinate to the logic of commercialism and commodification.

3.2. LOCAL HISPANIC COMMUNITIES – COLOMBIAN STYLE SALSA

During the 1970s and 1980s, Australia fostered a multicultural policy under which citizens were encouraged to reproduce their ethnic cultural heritage (Lo Bianco 2003). Local ethnic enclaves came into being, and although no strict cultural divisions developed, there is now e.g. a suburb in which many Italians live, another where many Greeks reside and, as already mentioned, there is also a suburb – Fairfield – where a lot of people with Latin American heritage live. Latin American presence is visible here. There are shops that sell food and other items from Latin America, and there are both official and unofficial celebrations within the communities, such as festivals for independence days or family celebrations. "Traditional" studies on language and identity can be conducted within this area as it is possible to detect ethnic communities – in the Latin American case, these can be subdivided into national communities that have sometimes rather opposing relationships. Although members of these groups emphasize that they are not one group that identifies as "Latinos" (but some even distance themselves from this term, as they associate it with lower class (U.S.) Americans), there is a sense of a pan-Latin American identity that can be assumed on grounds of the exis-

---

9 The term "ethnic", in the Australian case, refers usually to people of non-northern European background, which is related to the "White Australia" policy that was abandoned in the late 1960s (Lo Bianco 2003:19).
tence of newspapers and web resources that concern all Latin American nationalities (see e.g. www.latinos.com.au).

Obviously, these ethnic groups are not constituted by Salsa dancing and are in this sense not Salsa CofPs. However, for some nationalities, especially for Colombians, Venezuelans, Puerto Ricans and Cubans, the dance is part of their cultural heritage and thus is a vital element in festivities and the general reproduction of cultural identity – even if it is, to a certain extent, the Australian situation that is responsible for the maintenance of this practice, and not necessarily the "original" culture (for similar observations regarding the Canadian and the German context, see Papadopulos 2003, Pietrobruno 2006).

The main dance style in the ethnic communities is Colombian Style Salsa. Colombian Style Salsa is characterized by its relative simplicity (Pietrobruno 2006:68). The style of dance is often referred to as "backyard Salsa" by members of the mainstream CofP. Typically, there are no courses for this style, and it is assumed that children learn to dance from their parents and other relatives and friends. This style is less elaborate than L.A. Style and the main focus is on the experience of dancing as a couple. Complicated turns and steps are avoided and couples are in a very close embrace, their bodies are in contact more or less from tip to toe and the dance has, at least for an outsider, strong sexual connotations. Dancers of this style generally have a positive attitude to the appropriation of "their" cultural practice by others and see this as a sign for the attractiveness of their culture, which is also described as "bounciness", although one informant notes that

what the people do here is not Salsa.

The members of the Latin communities of Sydney are usually bilingual with Spanish and English. Despite the official multilingual policy of Australia being described as celebrating cultural and linguistic diversity (Lo Bianco 2003:6, Phillipson and Skutnabb-Kangas 1997), interviewees describe their personal histories – at least during the 1970s and 1980s – not in terms of recognition and respect for their linguistic and cultural background but report on experiences of racism:

1 to be honest, when we were growing up ..., 
2 ahm, there was the Wog thing, like you know, there was, you know, there was Wog, 
3 you know what Wog means? 
4 Wog means, ahm, ..., like ahm (1) 
5 people that aren't from Australia, 
6 yeah, that used to be a big thing in school as kids when we were growing up

The term "Wog", is a derogatory term for Australians of Southern European and Arabian descent, and it is obviously also applied to Latin Americans. The divide that exists between Anglo-Australians and "others", sometimes denied by official bodies, is demonstrated here. The performance of a "normal" Anglo-European Australian identity also includes the usage of English – and, in certain localities, only English. Not to be monolingual can, in some contexts, even be considered embarrassing, which is also indicated in the following quote:

1 then there are these (?hicks?) 
2 who would rather die than having their friends hearing them speaking another language 
3 because as soon as you do that, you're the weirdo

---

10 This is a term for provincial, anti-intellectual Australians from the countryside.
Speaking a language other than English, as it is described in this passage, is the "marked" case. In order to belong to the "normal" part of Australian society, it is not desirable to be bilingual, and social pressures within this lower class environment seem to dictate a monolingual norm. The native language education for minority pupils at school that is sometimes reported in interviews does not seem to mitigate this. Indeed, one might speculate whether this type of schooling, directed at non-mainstream children only, is indirectly supporting the tendency towards a monolingual Australia (regarding these monolingual tendencies, see e.g. the PDF on Australian Government. Australia 2020 2008 where the government criticizes explicitly Australia's low degree of bi- and multilingualism). While Clyne, in this context, describes Australia as having a "monolingual mindframe" (see Clyne 2005), Piller even speaks of an "ideology that considers multilingualism as 'un-Australian'" (Piller 2006:304). Nevertheless, many members of the ethnic communities of Sydney consider it important to maintain Spanish in order to be able to communicate with family members who are either too old to have learned English or who live in Latin America. Yet, many parents do not succeed in maintaining the ethnic language and within this study, there was one case where the children of Spanish-speaking parents did not speak Spanish at all, although the parents only spoke Spanish with the children. In these community contexts, languages other than English are understood as transporting and maintaining ethnic identity, and, facing the social pressures of an Anglo-Australian norm, at least in certain social classes, the desire to assimilate may be stronger than the wish to maintain heritage ties (Clyne 2005).

Spanish, within the ethnic Latin American communities, mediates national or ethnic identity. In general, the notion of a bilingual identity remains within a national discourse that constructs the world as consisting of distinct cultural and linguistic entities. But belonging to an ethnic community does not seem to be an attractive choice for everybody. As the discursive construction of the "normal" Australian is that of an English-speaking Australian, the maintenance of a language for heritage reasons is tied to the performance of an "other" identity. It can be inferred from the term "backyard Salsa" – a style that, according to one mainstream interviewee, "hasn't changed since the 1970s" – that the reproduction of ethnicity through cultural practices such as Salsa can be perceived as belonging to a discourse of traditionalism (for a discussion on the role of the dichotomy tradition vs. modernity and its role in sociolinguistics, see Rampton 2000b). Connotations of traditionality and backwardness do not make it necessarily appealing to stick to a heritage language, at least not for those who want to perform a more mainstream identity, which itself is linked to images of economic success and middle class values. In this respect, ethnic identity also intersects and cooperates with issues of class, where the performance of non-mainstream ethnicity is linked to the lower end of the class stratum.

In order to understand why certain ethnic identities are tied to notions of backwardness, it is also helpful to refer to the history of Australia's language policy, which began to support multilingualism in the 1970s, which then faced a period of "Asianism" where the learning of Asian languages for economic reasons was fostered, and after that, involved a return to a focus on English literacy in the 1990s in a context of economism and internationalization (Lo Bianco 2003:20-27). Bilingualism and ethnic identity in the Australian context are thus also connected to a legacy of social policies from a time when multilingual ideologies were part of the desire to reconstruct national identity into a more pluralist form, and where this reconstruction was explicitly linked to class politics, immigration and equality (ibid.: 22). This legacy, belonging to national, societal discourses of the 1970s and 1980s, may actually enforce the perception of "authentic" ethnic identity and bilingualism as linked to an "unfashionable" past.

There is, however, a third community of Salsa-lovers in Sydney, where some dancers with an ethnic Latin background use their "authentic" background as a resource within this more hybrid Community of Practice.
3.3. HYBRID SALSA: THE "SALSA REPUBLIC"

The main dance studio of this third Community of Practice is called Salsa Republic (www.salsarepublic.com.au). As it is the only CoP in which ethnic boundaries are transgressed in a conscious way, I also call this the "hybrid" community (a "classic" text on newer hybrid formations of identity is Hall 1994). In contrast to the flashy venues of the mainstream Salsa CoP, the dance school is located in a loft in a small and dark street close to Central railway station. The atmosphere of this school provokes stereotypical images of the poor but passionate dancers to be found in Hollywood movies such as "Flashdance". Already the name of the school carries interesting connotations in terms of the construction of transnationalism, as the term "republic" hints at the construction of a "nation" that is in this case a space that exists above and beyond the geographical territory of a nation. The logo of the school, a red star, relates to Cuba and its Communist regime, but it is not only the political connotations that play a role in choosing this image – it is also chosen because the school offers classes in Cuban Style Salsa. As will become clear in the following, Salsa dancing within this CoP seems to be related to very different aspects than in either the ethnic context or the mainstream environment.

Although the school also offers lessons in L.A. Style, the founder of the school has a background in European dance and likes both styles, L.A. and Cuban. But it is the specialty of the school that it offers classes in Cuban Style. In Cuban Style Salsa, there is a lot of emphasis on the movements of the body as a whole. The complicated steps and turns that are produced in L.A. Style Salsa are not found but instead "holistic body movements", as a teacher of this style describes it, are very important. There is a conscious differentiation from the commercialized varieties of the dance in more mainstream Salsa CoP, as can be inferred from the following passage from an interview with a Cuban Style dance teacher:

1. Then you have, on the other side (.)
2. the other, which is the L.A. style. (.)
3. which I respect (.)
4. but I personally don't like.
5. I just think that it (. ) takes away a lot of the (. ) the (. ) roots
6. and, and the rest of it, where Salsa comes from (0,5)
7. and tries to make it, um, globalize, ah, it globalizes it.

As this teacher is aware of the political background of Salsa, he criticizes the cultural disconnection that is produced within the practice of L.A. Style. Later on, he describes L.A. Style as "technical" and "controlled", which for him has negative connotations. The issue of authenticity also seems to be important here – he talks about "the roots", the cultural and social origins of Salsa. It is important for the interviewee to see Salsa as embedded in its social, political and cultural history and this distinguishes him from the people who only learn the techniques of steps. Dancing Cuban Salsa is an active message that expresses a differentiation from the dancers of L.A. Style, and this hints at the particular type of identity that is performed in this context. One aspect of the performance of this identity is the outward appearance. Clothing, for example, is a lot more casual than in the mainstream CoP. The dressy style of the mainstream CoP contrasts with the jeans and t-shirts that are worn in the Salsa Republic. The casualness of clothing, the slightly shabby impression of the location, and the red stars that are found on flyers and posters in connection with the interest in Cuban dance, express a more relaxed atmosphere and might also be interpreted as being located within more left-wing discourses, where commercialism is criticized and communist/socialist ideologies are approached with a relatively positive attitude. Analyzing the identity performance of the members of this group, it turns out that it is the casual lifestyle of an educated middle class that is performed, but within this performance, ethnicity and language are important, too, albeit in a different fashion than in the two other CoPs.
The ethnic and linguistic composition of this Salsa CoP is significant because of the mixture of people with native and non-native Spanish language background. Although people of many ethnic backgrounds also intermingle in the mainstream CoP, the hybrid CoP is different in that for "real" Latin Americans, the celebration of ethnic "originality" is an important and deliberately emphasized part of identity performance. Members of this CoP are usually aware of who is "really" Latin American and being "real" or having contact with "real" Spanish-speakers is of high value. This is confirmed e.g. by the fact that Salsa Republic deliberately employs Latin Americans and also by interview passages, where interviewees state that they go to certain places in order to meet "real" Spanish-speakers. While in the mainstream Salsa scene, ethnicity does not play an explicit role, and while ethnicity is a crucial aspect of Salsa in the ethnic communities, this hybrid community celebrates ethnic authenticity but at the same time transgresses it. The owner of the dance studio, for example, is white Australian, and she emphasizes her Irish heritage, saying that she belongs to the "fourth generation"\textsuperscript{11}, a marker of Australian authenticity. This pride in her Australian roots does not, however, reflect a mono-cultural, nationalist ideology. She emphasizes her close ties to people who are from other mainly Latin American countries and is at the same time proud of her daily contact with Latin Americans through her work, where musicians and dance teachers often have a Latin background. Her dance pupils are mostly white Australians, usually with a high level of education - many pupils are university students. Next to these white Australian students, there are also many Latin Americans involved in the dance studio. The majority of these, interestingly, do not come originally from Sydney but are international students who have come to Australia to study and who usually plan to return to Latin America when they have finished their studies. In fieldwork here, I encountered only one Latin American who grew up in Sydney. This confirms the observation above (3.2.) that being "ethnic" in Australia seems to be related to belonging to lower classes, and for Latin Americans from Sydney with a higher education, this may make it unattractive.

In the hybrid CoP, the meanings of Salsa dancing and Spanish are very different from those attached to the reproduction of ethnic heritage. The presence of Latin Americans is appreciated in this community. It seems to be important not only to teach authentic dance steps but also to immerse students in the whole culture that is seen as being related to Salsa. For this, the presence of Latin Americans and also of the Spanish language is crucial. It is thus revealing that many dance pupils see it as a goal to acquire a degree of proficiency in Spanish. The dance school has an agreement with a language school, where discounts are given to dance pupils. The instructions in the Salsa lessons are often in Spanish, and the receptionist at the entrance of the school speaks Spanish with everybody who can speak it. Being able to speak Spanish is a prestigious activity. When I tell the owner of Salsa Republic that in the beginning, I had difficulties finding Salsa dancers who speak Spanish, she replies:

\begin{verbatim}
1 S: Oh God, oh no, EVERYBODY speaks Spanish |here
2 B: |Oh, really? |
3 S: |not everybody but (. ) almost
\end{verbatim}

It is important for her to emphasize that "here" in "her" CoP, Spanish is an important part of the whole cultural experience. Even though she admits in line 3 that her first comment might have been a bit exaggerated, she then explains that at least some Spanish is used even by those who do not speak it fluently:

\begin{verbatim}
1 all the people here, that don't speak Spanish in Salsa, are affected by Spanish and use Spanish words (. )
2 all the time (1)
3 because it just comes up. ( . ) in Salsa
\end{verbatim}

\textsuperscript{11} To be of the "fourth generation" means that she describes herself as a descendant of the first group of settlers from Europe.
This perception is obviously very different from the one that is found in the mainstream CoP. Language crossing – the "use of a language or variety that, in one way or another, feels anomalously 'other'" and that is not part of the own ethnic repertoire (Rampton 2000a:55) – has the function of creating a sense of belonging to this particular community. Additionally, this small-scale context, i.e. the CoP of the Salsa Republic, relates to the much bigger sphere of a global Salsa community, an "imagined community" in Anderson’s sense (1985).

Yet, there are other important aspects in the analysis of this form of language crossing. On the one hand, they relate to the Australian geopolitical situation and the perception of Australia as monolingual, and on the other hand, they relate to the construction of elitist identities. Having spoken about the fact that language learning seems to be more common in Europe, the interviewee suggests in the following passage that the geopolitical situation of Australia makes language learning a difficult enterprise:

1 It's different in Australia because it's so far.
2 In Europe you can go for a month to a country. Or just in your holidays.
3 And and you can learn. You can go over the other weekend to Spain or somewhere.

The fact that Australia officially defines itself as being multilingual (Australian Government. Department of Citizenship and Immigration 2007, Lo Bianco 2003) seems to go unnoticed by this white Australian. Despite the everyday contact with people who have native languages other than English, the interviewee refers to the monolingual and far-off situation of Australia to explain the low numbers of Australians who learn other languages (Australian Government. Australia 2020 2008:5). This perception means that learning a second language not only functions in the expression of belonging to a local CoP – it also expresses belonging to the privileged class of language learners, as can be inferred from the following quote:

1 Here, it's a major commitment.
2 So (.) it's usually life-altering. If somebody here decides to learn another language, it's life altering.
3 Cause you need to (.) you know (.) try to somehow to go to that other country. I mean to really speak the language.

In order to learn a language, the learner has to go abroad, which in the Australian context, is very expensive and certainly not affordable for everybody. As a sign for being "truly" culturally interested, learning a language is related here to the intersection of lifestyle and class. Perceiving the world as consisting of separate territories in which different cultures reside and different languages are spoken, the ability to speak a second language fluently seems to be determined by money and commitment. As Australia itself is indirectly constructed as monolingual, other languages can only be used in other countries – although this obviously contradicts the everyday experience within the CoP. Yet the identity that is performed by white Australians when they engage in Salsa dancing, in the acquisition of Spanish and in extended stays in Spanish-speaking countries is also an indicator of class. The culturally interested, highly educated and rather affluent language learner could be perceived of as what Hannerz has labeled "cosmopolitans". Performing a cosmopolitan identity is defined as

... first of all an orientation, a willingness to engage with the Other. It entails an intellectual and esthetic openness toward divergent cultural experiences, a search for contrasts rather than uniformity. (Hannerz 1996a:103)
Although Hannerz has been criticized for his elitist view on cosmopolitans (Römhild 2007), the definition of Hannerz from the 1990s reflects quite well the phenomenon of the Spanish-speaking Salsa-dancers in Sydney. Hannerz maintains that the lower middle classes and labor migrants are typically not cosmopolitan, as cosmopolitans have a special relationship to intellectualism, where the engagement with other cultures is based on the idea of intention, rather than need (ibid. 105ff.). This has also implications for the cosmopolitan's relationship to the culture of origin, as the cosmopolitan can "choose to disengage from it" (ibid.:104) and thus performs a prestigious position in which culturally decontextualised knowledge – metacultural knowledge – is acquired. The ability to make "divergent cultural experiences" – in this case with Salsa and Spanish – is thus an opportunity to show economic as well as cultural capital (Bourdieu 1979). This contrasts with the meaning of performing Latin American culture, dance and language in the ethnic communities, where the engagement with this culture is tied to traditionalism and connects to a homeland. Also, this is different to the mono-lingual ideology of the mainstream CoP that, from this perspective, is quite provincial.

In contrast to the study of language crossing by Rampton, where it is conceived that dominated individuals cultivate solidarities through practices of crossing (Rampton 1995:294), the act of language crossing in this cosmopolitan context is not an act of solidarity among the dominated – it is rather an appropriation from above. Although the cultural appropriation might not be perceived as extreme as in the mainstream example, the cosmopolitan crossing has nothing to do with solidarity and is characterized by choice. This choice instrumentalizes cultural and linguistic forms in order to create and perform cosmopolitan identity. "Social knowledge about ethnicity is actively processed" (ibid.:283) but the participation in the other culture is a temporary activity in which mainstream individuals can always switch back to their "normal" self. The ability to switch, not the authentic production of ethnicity, is vital in the expression of cultural capital. "The cosmopolitan may embrace the alien culture, but he [sic] does not become committed to it. All the time he knows where the exit is" (Hannerz 1996a:104).

It is questionable whether these practices can be called "liminal", whether they have a longer lasting effect on everyday reality, or whether they are rather to be understood as "liminoid", where the effects are confined to the space of performance itself (terminology from Turner 1974 in Rampton 1995:233-237). Ethnic categories are usually not put into question and may even be enforced through the romanticized, othering desire of the hegemonic majority. Spanish, as the "other" world language, is appropriated by those who can afford a lifestyle that includes travel, culture and time to spend in dance studios and language classes. The degree of subversion is very questionable if ethnic boundaries are not transgressed but where ethnic traits are rather consumed as lifestyle options and where, despite claims to authenticity, "the consumer's personal taste and purchasing power matter as much or more than their early socialization" (Rampton 2000a:55).

Nevertheless, there is an aspect of liminality that can be detected in the language and dance practices of the hybrid Salsa scene. Those who truly cross boundaries and transgress and transform everyday reality are, paradoxically, those who do have an early socialization with Latin American culture. However, the boundaries they transgress are not ethnic boundaries but the intersections of ethnicity and class as they have developed in the Australian context of multiculturalism. "Ethnicity" of Australians, instead of being related to a working-class immigrant background, is linked to the value of cosmopolitanism. Latin Americans, due to their ability to speak Spanish, their ability to perform "authentic" identity, can reappropriate their linguistic and cultural knowledge and become part of a global "'new class', people with credentials, decontextualised cultural capital" (Hannerz 1996a:108).

12 It is revealing that most Latin Americans in this elite context migrated to Australia as adults, where they did not experience the stigma of otherness during their socialization.
13 This analysis questions Hannerz's definition of the cosmopolitan as not being a labour migrant or stemming from working classes (see also Römhild 2007).
4. CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that in Sydney's Salsa scene, ideological positionings and language ideologies can very often be detected from the body moves on dance floors:

The performance of L.A. Style hints to the perception of Salsa as a consumerist action. This is related to a global hegemony of capitalist ideologies where the commodification of culture is constructed as a positive value. Within this context, there is an English-only attitude, where other languages are largely invisible. Spanish words have the function of branding the activity as "Latin".

Dancing Colombian Style is connected to traditional approaches of expressing ethnic identity where language and identity are seen as being intrinsically linked. Multilingualism is seen as a value in transmitting intergenerational communication and knowledge but is sometimes also, within the Australian context, seen as stigmatizing.

Cuban Style expresses cosmopolitan values, where multilingualism is useful in the construction of an elite identity. Authentic ethnic identity, formerly an expression of heritage, can be appropriated as belonging to this culturally interested, intellectual and transnational class.

What becomes obvious here is that attitudes towards language and language ideologies are always embedded in complex cultural settings. Political, social and discursive environments are in a reciprocal relationship to constructions of multilingualism and their meanings. Very small scale issues like differences of a dance style can convey meanings that relate to attitudes towards language acquisition but also to much broader issues, like cultural globalization and capitalist ideology.

Without doubt, there are intense forms of cultural transformation, cultural mixing and also language crossing involved in the practice of Salsa in Australia, but it remains unclear whether these transformations challenge the established power structures, or, indeed, the way in which the concepts of language and of society are constructed. The type of language crossing as it is found in the case of the Salsa Republic shows a certain disentanglement of language from ethnic identity in the construction of a globalized, cosmopolitan élite identity. It is nevertheless difficult to understand this disentanglement, which seems to question nationalist categories, as necessarily subversive in a political sense. The appropriation of a language in order to participate in an elitist lifestyle does not question existing hierarchies of power or established intersections of class and ethnicity. The re-appropriation of an ethnic heritage as cosmopolitan might here be interpreted as the most transgressive act, in which there is a form of restructuring of established intersections of class and ethnicity.

Concerning the questioning of consolidated language ideologies that construct languages as given and distinct entities, these new types of multilingual identity and multilingual language practices, irrespective of whether native or acquired, do not seem to question standardized varieties of language. The effects of this type of multilingualism on the deconstruction of normalized language are difficult to evaluate, as the practice rather seems to be connected to what Pujolar observes:

[m]ultilingual policies may be devised in ways that ensure the privileged position of dominant groups who foster knowledge of powerful 'foreign' languages in their standard forms but delegitimize or ignore other languages and other forms of multilingual competence and performance (e.g. code-switching, heterogeneous skills). (Pujolar 2007:78)

What one should not forget is that in the context described in this paper, it is two of the most widely spoken, most prestigious languages of the world, and the other languages potentially involved – home languages of many of the informants, mixed codes, etc. – were not even mentioned. This again confirms Pujolar, when he says that "... discourses on globalization
can also be used to [...] construct new linguistic hierarchies that distinguish between 'global/cosmopolitan' and 'national/local' languages." (ibid.:83). These new linguistic hierarchies, these cosmopolitan but standardized types of multilingualism, may produce a more plural but not necessarily a more equal world and it will be worthwhile to observe their development in the future.

References


Transcription conventions

(.) pause of less than a second
(1.5.) approximate length of pause in seconds
(text?) speech hard to discern, analyst’s guess
text stressed, louder
téxt accents indicate a rise of tone